

Arlington Historic District Commissions

April 17, 2014
Whittemore Robbins House

Final & Approved Minutes

Commissioners Present: D. Baldwin, C. Barry, M. Bush, B. Cohen, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, J. Nyberg, S. Makowka arrived for 9p, M. Penzenik, J. Worden arrived at 9:25p

Commissioners Not Present: J. Black, M. Logan

Guests: M. Erulker, K. Connelly, M. Walsh, D. Nowell, S. Walsh

1. **AHDC Meeting Opens** 8:00pm
B. Cohen officiated in absence of S. Makowka
2. **Appointment of alternate Commissioners:** Mt. Gilboa/Crescent Hill – B. Cohen, C. Hamilton, C. Barry; Pleasant Street – M. Bush, C. Barry, C. Hamilton
3. **Approval of draft minutes from March 27, 2014;** D. Baldwin moved approval of minutes as presented, C. Barry seconded. Minutes approved unanimously.
4. **Communications**
 - a. Email asking for clarification for 9 Crescent Hill Ave. location in District
 - b. Email re: 170 Pleasant Street (Gillis) non-approved CONA work
 - c. Emails re: Community Preservation Act and Town Meeting presentation
 - d. Email re: Upcoming Master Plan Meeting
 - e. CONA request for 59 Jason (Bouvier) for fence
 - f. CONA request for 105 Pleasant Street (Erulker) re: gutters, siding repairs
 - g. CONA request for 195 Pleasant Street (Hamel) re: house painting, gutter replacement, rear window sill repair
 - h. M. Bush talked with owner 187 Lowell Street (C. Grinnell) re: unapproved work – application sent for CONA
 - i. Emails on house on corner of Jason and Irving. Painting and repair and replacement of shingles. CONA would have been issued.
5. **New Business**

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm

 1. Informal Hearing re: 105 Pleasant Street (Erulker) re: Fiberglass Gutter Request – Applicant said they need to replace gutters due to failure and age. They requested that they use fiberglass gutters made by the Fiberglass Gutter Company to replace the existing wood gutters. The gutters will be identical in appearance but will be in fiberglass instead of wood. M. Bush moved that proposed changes are so insubstantial that they qualify for a 10 day certificate. Seconded by J. Nyberg. Unanimous approval. Motion by M. Bush for installation of fiberglass gutters as proposed for 105 Pleasant Street. Seconded by J. Nyberg. Unanimous approval. Monitor appointed S. Makowka

2. Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 50 Westmoreland Ave. (Sessa) re: installation of solar panels. J. Nyberg commented for the record that he is pro-solar, but he is just not pro in-your face on the street solar. In an historic district he has an issue with the streetscape view. C. Hamilton said she worries about satellite dishes and what happens when it is broken and when it is hanging down and looking terrible. B. Cohen and others commented that it is outside our jurisdiction whether the maintenance cycle is being or not being followed by the owner. The commission prefers panels to have black frames rather than the alternate option of silver. The applicant responded that they are only installing the black frames nowadays. D. Baldwin said he agrees with J. Nyberg that it at least it does meet the standard of a rectangle shape on the roof, and realizes that putting it on the other face just doesn't work due to the sun position. This is also a non-contributing structure in a district. M. Bush asked why there is room for a fifth row but they don't have one. The applicant said it is not necessary for the site and due to the leasing arrangement the owners are not allowed to over-install. No comment from observers. D. Baldwin moved to accept the proposal as presented with stipulation that the frame be black and the conduit to blend with the house. Due to house being a non-contributing structure and there being no other option for the panel locations based on site, this approval does not set a precedent for allowing panels on a visible front setting. Seconded by C. Barry. J. Nyberg voted no. J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, D. Baldwin, C. Barry, M. Bush, B. Cohen, M. Penzenik voted yes.

8:47pm Meeting adjourned until 9pm.

9:02pm Meeting Reconvened

3. Continuation of Formal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street (Walsh) re: addition of new structure and refurbishment of existing structure. T. Cain, architect presented a study showing the FAR (Floor Area Ratio) numbers for the other properties in the neighborhood. The FAR is a record of the density of the neighborhood and the house relative to its neighbors. #40 Russell has an FAR of 1.6, the highest. Without the addition, this property at .20 is the lowest, but with the addition it is only .34 which is still one of the lowest in the neighborhood. J. Cummings thanked the applicant for the information and said it is very helpful. T. Cain said they addressed the corner boards on the addition and carried those through. S. Makowka asked about how the left hand corner worked around the rear side. On the side that isn't a protruding bay, it's a flat feature outlined with the two columns. There is a corner board which becomes a pilaster framing those windows. Answer is that it is not a bay. The only bay is 3 window bay on the first floor left hand side. B. Cohen asked why end windows on the right side are highlighted on rear elevation. The applicant added a corner board on the front and side to match the main house. B. Cohen asked if you want that trim on all those windows. Answer – based on corner board returning corner. On second floor putting a panel in would be more appropriate. Treated rear elevation to look like view on page one. Discussion about putting a panel. Others feel it makes it awkward and wouldn't want panel. C. Barry said he would leave it just the way it is. S. Makowka asked if the treatment of the sills of the windows continuing across the windows and wrap the corner is typical. On page 3 it is an element between the clapboards and the trim. Consensus that it's fine by the other commissioners. Look at page 1, at existing house, white screened in porch, the roof wraps around the corner board. It also happens on page 3 where the corner board is wrapped on both ends of upper roof. Doesn't bother B. Cohen. The foundation will be brick. Applicant pointed out on bottom drawing, page 3, rear elevation. Owners would like to replace a window that had been replaced with a metal casement, single pane window in the 1930's. They would like to replace to original size. B. Cohen said it would be fine. T. Cain believes that is the only change to original house from prior meeting. J. Cummings said they've

been incredibly helpful and all the comments are addressed every time. S. Makowka asked about the roofline which seems more in keeping with original house. Previously the design was a peaked roof on the one story connection. The flat roof now shown is more in the style of the addition than of the existing. The change makes it seem more organic. It also solves the problem on the side where the window is not set into the roof. The new design addresses concerns related to the corner board and roofline of the one story connector. There seems to be a nice feel between the old and the new when it comes to similarities of roofline. The small outbuilding structures are being removed in the back of the yard. No decision about the pergola yet. Comments from visitors – neighbor thinks it's fantastic and supports the project as a Russell Street home resident. C. Barry likes articulating shadow lines and different parts of the trim. That is really thought through and executed very carefully. The details will be very important. D. Baldwin asked about columns – are they wood. Yes that is the plan, but that is not a requirement on this particular addition. If not wood as long as it's painted. Polystone was mentioned by C. Barry. S. Makowka said he appreciates the FAR information. One of the features of this site is the openness. Existing condition it is the least densely developed lot and it's noted in the original designation. That's important to the house. B Cohen commented that it's still very low. S. Makowka said info says it's still on the lower end and because in this particular application the location of the addition is minimized visually from the street and the openness of the lot. Set back on far corner, not open part of lot public participates in – Water Street especially. This doesn't impact on that space and in this particular situation because it is still such an open lot he is leaning towards being acceptable. In case by case situation he will decide on approvals. So for the record in this case he would be ok. D. Baldwin asked about main house being clapboarded. The owners would like to remove substitute siding and restore what clap boards need to be replaced and repair any damage uncovered when that comes off. That is their full intent and then of course to paint everything to match. M Penzenik said she appreciates that the roof on the connector was changed and this is better plan. C. Barry moved approval of plans as submitted on 4/17/14 with potential removal of artificial siding from main house, the metal window replacement with new one to match existing windows, details to be consistent with the period of the house, subject to approval of monitor prior to installation, seconded by S. Makowka, D. Baldwin and C. Hamilton abstained, approved by J. Cummings, C. Barry, M. Bush, S. Makowka and M. Penzenik. Monitor: C. Barry appointed.

J. Worden (who could not vote as not present for tonight's part of the hearing) raised a point of order about the voting commissioners – clarified that all were present last month.

4. Discussion of Community Preservation Act presentation for Town Meeting. S. Makowka received request for statement of support from HDC at Town Meeting for article they have submitted. There may be very short presentation of support from a representative. He and J. Worden are TM members and will be attending. Narrow – we support Historic Preservation component.

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtor

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

- a. Neighbor to 75 Pleasant Street (Boston Church of Christ) concerns. Some of the windows are looking small. Wants to be sure moderator is looking at project. Building itself even looks larger than envisioned. B. Cohen as monitor will contact architect and follow up that everything is as presented.

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler – 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)
5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pemsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
11. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
12. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
13. 111 Pleasant Street (Frideau – 11-49) – Nyberg – COA (Fence)
14. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
15. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
16. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
17. 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 12-17J) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
18. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) – Penzenik – COA (House Redesign)
19. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
20. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
21. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-37A) – Cohen – COA (Railing)
22. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
23. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
24. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) – Cohen – COA (House Addition)
25. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
26. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
27. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
28. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)
29. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
30. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
31. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
32. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
33. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
34. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
35. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)
36. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
37. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
38. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
39. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
40. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)

41. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
42. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
43. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
44. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
45. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
46. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
47. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
48. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
49. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
50. 37 Jason Street (Lees – 13-61J) – Makowka – DENIAL (solar panels)
51. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
52. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P) – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
53. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
54. 24 Central Street (Donelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
55. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
56. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
57. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
58. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
59. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
60. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)
61. 19 Wellington Street (Kirchheimer – 13-72P) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
62. 135 Pleasant St. Unit 9&10 (Atkinson-Bing – 13-73P) – Makowka – COA (a/c condenser and rear porch door)
63. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)
64. 735 Mass. Ave. (Highrock Church – 13-76J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
65. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-77P) – Barry – COA (skylight)
66. 17 Irving Street (Town of Arl-Parmenter – 13-78P) – Makowka – DENIAL – fence
67. 11 Russell Terrace (Boroway – 14-01R) – Makowka – CONA (basement windows/siding)
68. Lot 47 (aka 247) Pleasant Street (Alouette Rlty/Noonan – 14-02P) – COA (New Building)
69. 111 Pleasant St. (Fredieu – 14-03P) – COA (Awnings)
70. 40 Westmoreland Ave. (Radoslovich – 14-04M) – CONA (Rear & deck sliders)
71. 17 Russell St. (Makowka – 14-05R) – 10 Day COA (roof & gutters)
72. 21 Oak Knoll (Donal – 14-06P) – CONA (side door)

Meeting Adjourned 10:00pm